

**The text that follows is a PREPRINT.**

Please cite as:

Fearnside, P.M. 1986. "Postscript from Philip M. Fearnside." (on comments on Grande Carajás). World Development 14(3): 414.

ISSN: 0305-750X

Copyright: Pergamon

The original publication is available at:

#### GRANDE CARAJÁS: POSTSCRIPT TO HALL'S COMMENTS

I thank Anthony Hall for his comment on my paper on the Grande Carajás Program. We have come to similar conclusions regarding the dangers posed by PGC-Agrícola.

I hope that I have not given the impression that the program's favoring of large enterprises at the expense of small farmers is the result of "ill-informed or inefficient decision-making." On the contrary, plans such as those of the Grande Carajás Program can follow as logical results of quite competent execution of decision-making procedures that happen to be based on premises that appear unwise when viewed from the perspective of Brazilian society as a whole. The range of political and other forces that affect development plans such as PGC-Agrícola is illustrated by the history of the Transamazon Highway (Fearnside, 1984). As in the case of the Transamazon Highway, many of the strongest reasons for governmental decisions are left unstated in official pronouncements. The underlying structure of decision-making must be altered if the long history of socially and environmentally detrimental decisions is not to be repeated with each new development plan (Fearnside, 1985).

It was refreshing to be chided as overly-optimistic with respect to the future of small farmers in Amazonia. I am more accustomed to being labeled "alarmist," "pessimist", and "*derrotista*" (defeatist). I can only agree with Hall that the future is not bright unless profound changes are made.

#### REFERENCES

- Fearnside, P.M. 'Brazil's Amazon settlement schemes: Conflicting objectives and human carrying capacity', *Habitat International* Vol. 8, No. 1 (1984) pp 45-61.
- Fearnside, P.M. 'Deforestation and decision-making in the development of Brazilian Amazonia', *Interciencia* Vol. 10, No. 5 (1985) pp. 243-247.